



Examining the Constraints on Yachting Tourism Development in China: A Qualitative Study of Stakeholder Perceptions

Yunhao Yao *, Ruoquan Zheng and Merle Parmak 🕩



College of Public Administration and Humanities, Dalian Maritime University, Dalian 116000, China; ruoquanzheng@163.com (R.Z.); Parmak@merleparmak.eu (M.P.)

* Correspondence: yaoyunhao@dlmu.edu.cn or yunhaoyao@126.com

Abstract: Clarifying the current constraints facing the development of yachting tourism in China is key to ensuring the healthy development of this niche industry. This study uses grounded theory as a theoretical basis to conduct qualitative research and applies semi-structured interview techniques to examine stakeholders' views on the constraints on the development of yachting tourism in China, from the perspectives of both yachting supply and demand. MAXQDA2020 qualitative analysis software was used to determine the main constraints. The study identified seven of these constraints, including policies and regulations, government behaviors, the social development environment, marketing, infrastructure, expertise and manpower, and culture. Based on these constraints, and the recommendations for improving yachting tourism proposed by the interviewed stakeholders, the study offers seven strategies for the further development of yachting tourism, which have practical significance for this development both in China and abroad.

Keywords: yachting tourism; constraints; stakeholders; grounded theory; China



Citation: Yao, Y.; Zheng, R.; Parmak M. Examining the Constraints on Yachting Tourism Development in China: A Qualitative Study of Stakeholder Perceptions. Sustainability 2021, 13, 13178, https:// doi.org/10.3390/su132313178

Academic Editor: Alastair M. Morrison

Received: 29 October 2021 Accepted: 24 November 2021 Published: 28 November 2021

Publisher's Note: MDPI stavs neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



Copyright: © 2021 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/ 4.0/).

1. Introduction

With the growth of social wealth, the types of activities related to waterways are increasing significantly. As a product of high economic and social value, yachts can not only offer a brand-new leisure experience but also promote employment and the economic development of tourist destinations [1]. At present, yachting tourism is a kind of entertainment that combines leisure, competition, temporality, and other characteristics in one activity. Yachting tourism involves yacht product sales, yacht sports experiences, and other projects, and is usually accompanied by luxurious equipment and extensive services [2-4]. Leisure yachts give tourists the freedom to sail to different destinations and enjoy a lifestyle of entertainment [5]. The huge economic influence of yachting tourism has gradually been realized by the governments of many countries: countries and regions including Turkey, Greece, Italy, and Scotland, among others, have all developed yachting tourism to create more employment opportunities [5,6].

In China, with the continuous increase of national disposable income, the lifestyle of yachting tourism has gradually entered public view. In recent years, the Central State Council has issued several policies and regulations on the development of yachting tourism, such as the "Several Opinions of the State Council on Further Promoting Tourism Investment and Consumption" and the newly revised "Maritime Traffic Safety Law of the People's Republic of China" in April 2021, demonstrating that the national level of government has attached importance to and supports the development of yachting tourism. China's yachting industry has a history of approximately 20 years and was developed in the famous coastal cities of Xiamen, Shenzhen, Sanya, Shanghai, Qingdao, Dalian, and Tianjin, among others. After many years of fluctuation, China's public has begun to have a more rational understanding of yachts, the development and promotion policies issued by government management departments are gradually being put into place, and the overall business environment is improving.

Sustainability **2021**, 13, 13178 2 of 18

Yachting tourism in China is in the early stages of development, and, to date, there is very little related research literature. International research on yachting began early, and most studies have focused on exploring the impact of yachting activities on local economies, societies, and environments [3,5,7–10]. Domestic scholars are in the exploratory stage of yachting tourism research and are mostly focused on market consumption, the analysis of the current situation and development prospects [11,12], development countermeasures [13–15], and yacht club operations [16]. Among them, there are few quantitative studies, and most have undertaken qualitative research. To date, few studies have systematically defined the main constraints and obstacles that face yachting tourism in China. To better remove the constraints to the development of yachting tourism and promote the sustainable development of the industry, stakeholders' opinions and visions are the basis.

Therefore, the specific purposes of this paper are: (1) to identify the main constraints on the development of China's yachting tourism industry from its stakeholders' perceptions; (2) to provide implications and recommendations for the sustainable development of yachting tourism, that proposes recommendations for reference by China and other countries and regions. The rest of this article is structured as follows. The next section defines yachting tourism; thereafter, the qualitative research methods used are described. The following section integrates the interviews of various stakeholders to highlight the key constraints on the development of yachting tourism in China and introduces the proposed framework. Finally, the closing section puts forward development recommendations for the promotion of the industry.

2. Literature Review

2.1. Tourism Stakeholders

The term "stakeholders" refers to multiple subjects that have economic, legal, moral, and other interests in a certain activity or subject [17]. The stakeholder perspective was introduced into the tourism field in the 1980s [18,19]. In the past few decades, the tourism industry has grown rapidly. Many countries and regions are gradually realizing the positive impact of tourism and have begun to emphasize its sustainable development. Scholars have also begun to include stakeholder perspectives on multiple aspects in tourism research to explore ways to counter the industry's development issues from multiple angles.

The stakeholder perspective has been studied in a variety of tourism fields. In terms of the sustainable development of macro-regional tourism, stakeholder theory focuses on obstacles to the process of stakeholder participation. Previous studies have proposed that obstacles to stakeholder participation and public-private cooperation will lead to failures in tourism decision making [20,21]. In the context of specialized tourism research, which involves black tourism [22], medical tourism [23], eco-tourism [24], and disaster tourism [25]—through consultations with local communities, local governments, tourism companies, tourists, employees of tourism companies, employees of surrounding tourist attractions, tourism volunteer departments, experts, and scholars, etc.—the present study analyzes role positioning, clarifies attitudes and views, and discusses constraints on tourism development. Stakeholder theory has been used in tourism research, and it can remove the obstacles of cooperation among stakeholders in tourism activities and provide a basis of theoretical analysis for tourism development research.

As for maritime tourism, stakeholders may include yacht tourists, yachting tourism enterprise operators and employees, local governments, local tourism departments, those working in yacht marinas, yacht experts, and researchers. The existing research has focused on the trust among stakeholders regarding the protection of regional marine tourism ecological environments [26]; the measurement of stakeholders' cooperation performance, relationship performance, and development performance in marine leisure tourism terminals [27]; and the importance of dialogue and participation among stakeholders for the sustainable development of coastal, maritime, and cruise tourism [28]. However, there has

Sustainability **2021**, 13, 13178 3 of 18

been little research on yachting tourism to date, and the introduction of this perspective is critical for promoting the development of further yachting tourism.

2.2. Yachting Tourism

As an important part of nautical tourism, yachting tourism is a form of entertainment that has gradually emerged in recent decades [29]. The definition and understanding of yachting tourism differ, according to scholars' different research backgrounds and goals. For example, Mikulić et al. believed that, although yachting tourism does not have a recognized definition, it should be regarded within the broad concept of nautical tourism [1]. Diakomihalis, meanwhile, held that a yacht's main function is to provide users with tourism and leisure opportunities, which is mainly reflected in the crew's sufficient service ability to provide yacht users with food, water sports instruction, and so on [2]. Furthermore, according to Sariisik et al., as medium-sized ships that can carry up to 36 passengers for tourism and sports purposes, yachts provide tourism activities that are of great significance for economies and job creation [5].

After decades of research, international studies have mainly examined the economic, social, and ecological environmental impacts of yachting tourism [2,3,30], its management strategies [5,31], the key factors of the yachting tourism experience [1], and the sustainability of yachting tourism [32]. International research has continued indefinitely, with extensive content, emphasizing the use of quantitative research to provide the strategy for yachting tourism development. Chinese scholars have undertaken little research on yachting tourism, and their research methods have mostly been qualitative. In recent years, some scholars have devoted themselves to related quantitative research, analyzing the current status of regional yachting tourism development [13], yacht market consumption patterns [11], consumption behaviors [33], and yachting tourists' experiences [34].

Furthermore, yachting tourism converges with other industries, including positive promotion and negative impact. For example, pollution caused by yachting tourism can affect historical sites and the healthy development of heritage tourism [3]. Yachting tourism and fishery have temporal and spatial intersections. Currently, researchers are exploring the transformation of traditional fishing ports that might become multi-functional waterfront harbors, which can eventually develop modern fishing and yachting tourism, while promoting the common development of these waterfront leisure industries [35]. Additionally, there are ocean conflicts between the recreational use of yachting tourism and shellfish aquaculture [36]. Therefore, yachting tourism development needs the perspective of stakeholders.

The reasonable and healthy development of the tourism industry requires that tourism departments undertake appropriate planning according to the needs of various stakeholders, so as to correctly respond to the market demand [37]. China's yachting tourism industry contributes significantly to the marine economy [13]. However, the domestic research in this field remains in its initial stages of exploration. Therefore, this study focuses on the key constraints on the development of yachting tourism in China.

2.3. Yachting Tourism in China

Since the beginning of the 21st century, domestic land tourism resources have gradually tended toward saturation, and the development of water system tourism resources has been a new tourism growth point over the past 20 years. Generally, coastal regions are the main areas of yachting tourism development in China due to their specific advantages, such as superior geographical conditions, well-developed ports, and open positions to foreign countries [28]. For the construction of Hainan International Tourism Island, in particular, China's central government has allowed Hainan five unique opening pilot policies since 2011. In 2020, "the overall construction plan of Hainan FTP (free trade port)" proposed to "establish yacht industry reform, development, and an innovative pilot zone."

According to data from the China Cruise Yacht Industry Association (hereafter referred to as CCYIA) (2020), by 2019, China had more than 160 yacht clubs, 114 marinas,

Sustainability **2021**, 13, 13178 4 of 18

39.00% 30 38.00% 25 37.00% 20 36.00% 15 35.00% 10 34.00% 5 33.00% 0 32.00% 2019 2014 2015 2016 2017 2018 Market scale of private yachts 6.43 6.97 7.61 8.97 9.62 10.49 (100 million yuan) Market scale of yachts 20.92 18.7 19.8 24.38 25.72 27.45 (100 million yuan) Proportion of private yachts

11,000 yacht berths, and 25,000 yachts (including fishing boats and sailboats) [38]. Data on China's yachting market from 2014 to 2019, sourced from China's industrial information network, are shown in Figure 1.

Figure 1. Market scale of yachts and private yachts in China from 2014 to 2019.

34.39% 35.20%

However, there is a disparity in the development of yachting tourism in China compared with other East Asian and Southeast Asian countries. For example, South Korea has two advantages [39]: the government's willingness to provide employment opportunities within this industry; and the development of maritime transportation networks. Moreover, Singapore's advantageous performance is evident. First, it is suitable for yacht sailing throughout the year; second, taxes and fees on boats and their accessories are very low; and finally, many small and public marinas have been developed in the region [40]. Compared with neighboring countries, the environment for China's yachting tourism needs to be further improved.

36.38%

36.79%

37.40%

38.21%

Chinese scholars have observed distinct challenges in various research contexts. Zhang identified the disadvantages of yachting tourism in the Yangtze River Delta that included water pollution, busy waterways, and lack of culture [41]. Xu, Teng, and Tian highlighted that the industry's unstable management system and incomplete infrastructure are the obstructions to its development [14]. Cai and Li emphasized that the construction of infrastructure, and incomplete laws and regulations for marina development are hindering the expansion of this industry [42]. Development constraints to yachting tourism have been reflected in domestic scholars' studies, but none have systematically constructed a theoretical framework of development constraints from the empirical interview research materials.

Therefore, it can be identified from experience and theoretical research that revealing the constraints on the development of the yachting tourism industry and the countermeasures to break them should be the focus of current research.

3. Methods

(%)

To investigate the constraints on the development of China's yachting tourism, the present research adopted a qualitative approach. Qualitative research is suitable for the overall exploration of a certain research phenomenon and may involve questionnaires, interviews, observations, and text analysis. The process reflects the characteristics of the

Sustainability **2021**, 13, 13178 5 of 18

combination of data collection and analysis [43,44]; through the analysis of data, it can continuously explore the whole picture of a certain problem. For different data types, the analysis process adopts different technical support. The present study took an exploratory approach; therefore, grounded theory and MAXQDA2020 software were used.

3.1. Theoretical Background

The introduction of grounded theory was aimed at ending the subjectivity of qualitative research, and it was first proposed by Glazer and Strauss in 1967. This theory connects the gap between theory construction and empirical research methods and provides specific methods and procedures for continuously integrating meaning from data and finally constructing a theory. From then on, qualitative research has been a methodological cornerstone [45].

Specifically, as a research method, grounded theory includes a sampling method, three theoretical coding methods (including open, axial, and selective coding), comparative analysis, and other key strategies. According to Khali et al., grounded theory is a general research method that can gradually identify and integrate the scope of meaning from the data [46]. Using the main strategies, grounded theory can construct the concept of a key problem and the relationship between those concepts. The specific process is as follows. Direct data are obtained through empirical investigation, and the main and core categories are abstracted by means of comparison, reduction, integration, and transformation from complex data. Therefore, the grounded conceptual framework is rooted in objective data, formed through continuous comparison and repeated verification [47]. According to this, a semi-structured interview is a research method often used in qualitative research under the guidance of grounded theory. This forms a large volume of text data through researchers' in-depth conversations with the research object and provides the basic analysis data. This research followed the procedure of grounded theory by constantly classifying, comparing, integrating, reducing, and expanding the semi-structured interview data to form an explanatory framework for the research problems [48].

3.2. *Identification of Key Issues*

This study adopted the semi-structured interview method in this study. There were two requirements for the development of the interview questions [38]: the first was to meet the research purpose of exploring the constraints on the development of China's yachting tourism; the second was that it should respond to and expand the questions from the existing research. A suitable framework for discussing the constraints on the development of yachting tourism will be provided. Through an extensive literature review, including studies of tourism barriers in various fields, and through discussion and revision during the research team's regular meetings, five key issues were determined. The specific contents of the interview questions are shown in Table 1 [19,33,38,49]. The questions aimed to encourage the public sector, private sector, industry association, tourism consumer, and research stakeholders to consider the constraints on yachting tourism development from their own perspectives.

Table 1. Interview questions.

What are the weaknesses of yachting tourism in China?
What are the constraints to the development of yachting tourism in China?
What are the deficiencies in the management of yachting tourism by the relevant government departments in China?
What are the problems in the operation of yacht clubs and industry associations in China?
What are the problems of infrastructure construction, such as public yacht terminals, in China? How should the infrastructure be improved?

Sustainability **2021**, 13, 13178 6 of 18

3.3. Data Collection

To study the constraints on the development of yachting tourism and expand the scope of stakeholder selection [16], the research team visited Shanghai, Dalian, Shenzhen, Guangzhou, Xiamen, and other key developing yachting tourism cities in China to conduct field surveys on yachting tourism, taking advantage of the opportunities of yachting-related academic and industry seminars, including the 2019 Yacht Industry Development Forum, "The Seventh Yacht Industry Development Conference" in 2020, and the yacht exhibition in Shanghai in 2021. Finally, tourism stakeholders from the main coastal cities were selected as interviewees. To ensure comprehensiveness and effectiveness, the study's selection of stakeholders considered both the supply and the demand sides of tourism [34,43].

It identified five types of stakeholders and asked the interviewees for their informed consent: those working in public tourism management (such as the director of the Marine Department of Dalian Maritime Safety Administration (hereafter referred to as MSA) and the inspector of the Civil Military Integration Department of Industry and Information Technology), those working in private yacht enterprises (such the head of the Yacht Association, we-media figures of the yacht industry, etc.), the local yacht industry association, yachting tourism consumers, and related researchers.

To ensure the suitability of the interview process [50], the research team held several regular meetings to discuss, formulate, and revise the specific procedures and alternative plans. From 2018 to 2021, after selecting the potential interviewees, we sent letters to them to determine the time and place of the interviews. Each interview was conducted by the same interviewer, and the interview content was tape recorded by another team member. Before the interview, the researchers obtained consent from the interviewees to record the conversations. The interview method enabled the interviewees to discuss their own views around the five identified issues [38]. The interview content was initially transcribed, before the research team took turns to proofread the text to ensure the credibility of the data. To verify the interview contents and clarify any possible ambiguity [44], after the text material of each interview was created, it was sent to the interviewees for verification and confirmation. All interviewees replied that they were in agreement. As such, it was confirmed that the transcribed interview content was consistent with the interviewees' original responses.

3.4. Data Processing and Analysis

After interviews, the text content confirmed by the interviewees was imported into MAXQDA2020 as the research material for text analysis. Data processing and analysis progressed through two stages. First, the research team determined seven themes as the analysis units after several reviews and checks. Second, according to the content and purpose of the research materials, the subthemes were determined as the secondary category [43]. The themes were determined according to the open coding principle of grounded theory, and the connection between subthemes and themes was based on the principle of principal axis coding, all of which were derived from the text analysis [51,52].

Open coding is a process of naming the content in the text to determine the concept categories through careful analysis and comparison of the text [43]. In this process, the whole text content can be labeled as several different concepts, and dozens or even hundreds of named concepts can be compared and classified into genera. Following the framework of grounded theory, the researchers first encoded the text content 130 times through repeated analysis, in which the same text content or text content with the same meaning was encoded under the same code [53]. Thereafter, 125 codes were re-examined to find the codes with the same meaning expression, and 121 codes were finally determined as the secondary category (i.e., the subtheme).

The main task of axial coding is to clarify the relationship between concepts through comparison and integrate all codes with similar meanings into abstract, higher level categories. Through this process, it compared different concepts and organized 121 subthemes

Sustainability **2021**, 13, 13178 7 of 18

under seven main themes. The study also made many comparisons and undertook extensive reorganization to define the logical connection between the themes and subthemes.

4. Results and Discussion

According to the coding extracted using the grounded theory research method, seven themes and 121 subthemes, related to the constraints on the development of yachting tourism, were analyzed. The following section expands on these seven themes in the context of the development status of, and current research on, China's yachting tourism development.

4.1. Interviewees' Roles

The data were collected from March 2018 to April 2021 through interviews with many stakeholders in China's yachting tourism industry. There were 56 interviewees, of whom, 7 were from the public sector (approximately 13%); 9 were from the private sector (approximately 16%); 20 were yachting tourism consumers (approximately 36%); 9 were members of the Yacht Industry Association (approximately 16%); and 4 were researchers (approximately 7%). The research sample was considered sufficient to represent the multi-interest expression of China's yachting tourism industry. Moreover, the nature of the sample helped avoid data bias and can lay a foundation for further research on the current development constraints on yachting tourism. Table 2 lists the interviewees' roles.

 Table 2. Interviewees' roles.

Industry Sector	Organization	Number of Interviewees
D.11	China Cruise & Yacht Industry Association	2
	Marine Department of Dalian Maritime Safety Administration	1
	Civil Military Integration Department of the Ministry of Industry and Information Technology	1
Public	Former Vice Mayor of Qingdao	1
	China Communication Construction Fourth Navigation Engineering Survey and Design Institute	1
	China Communication Construction Water Transport Planning and Design Institute	1
Private	Dalian Xinghaiwan yacht marina	2
	Xiamen Wuyuanwan yacht marina	2
	Dalian Mingdao sailing club	1
	Shenzhen Longcheer yacht club	1
	Guangzhou Nansha yacht marina	1
	Ocean Blue Yacht Industry Media	1
	Guangzhou Deli Yacht Wharf Engineering Co., Ltd. (Guangzhou, China)	1
Consumer	Yachting tourists	20
Others	Local cruise and yacht associations	9
	Researchers	4
Total		56

4.2. Study Framework

According to the connotation and coding principle of grounded theory, the framework of the seven themes and multiple subthemes coded from the interview material is shown in Figure 2 and Table 3. Policies and regulations, government behaviors, the social development environment, marketing, infrastructure, expertise and manpower, and culture were found to be the main factors restricting the development of China's yachting tourism.

As shown in Table 3, the frequency of the occurrence of the subthemes indicated the number of times that each interviewee repeated a certain viewpoint. Among them, the most frequent subthemes, which emerged as the main constraints on the development of yachting tourism, can be summarized as a "lack of management rules and policies and regulations", "few professionals", "yachts are high-end luxury goods", and "lack of marine culture".



Figure 2. A framework of constraints to the development of yachting tourism in China.

Table 3. Themes and subthemes.

Main Themes	Subthemes	Frequency
	Lack of management rules and policies and regulations	12
	Lagging club development management regulations	5
	Lack of policies and regulations for marina construction	3
	Unclear industrial policy	3
Policies and regulations	COVID-19-related policies are "one size fits all"	2
0	High import tax	2
	Lack of industrial layout planning	1
	Inaccurate classification of yachts	1
	Lack open port functions of marinas	1
	Contradiction between the system and its execution	3
	Overlapping functions of supervision departments	3
	Contradiction between regulation and the market	2
Government behaviors	Over-implemented policy	2
	Safety management is not in place	2
	Inadequate service	2
	Regulatory authorities act independently	2
	Poor development environment	3
	Difficult club development environment	3
Social development environment	Industry association does not have a significant enough role	3
Social development environment	Unbalanced development among regions	2
	Unbalanced development among different cities	1
	No industry-wide relationships	1
	Yachts are high-end luxury goods	8
	Yachts are difficult to rent	5
	Imperfect market development	4
	Monotonous yacht activities	4
Marketing	Fewer people buy yachts	1
	No consumption awareness	1
	Lack of value evaluation system	1
	Lack of international marketing strategy	1
	Berth scarcity	1
	Lack of public marinas and supporting facilities	5
	Backward infrastructure	5
Infrastructure	Lack of infrastructure and supporting facilities	4
	No uniform standard for infrastructure	2
	Lack of positioning system	1

Sustainability **2021**, 13, 13178 9 of 18

Main Themes	Subthemes	Frequency
	Few professionals	9
Expertise and manpower	Unimplemented responsibility of shipowners and crew	1
-	Low quality of crew	1
C. Iv	Lack of marine culture	6
Culture	Less publicity	2

4.3. Constraints on the Development of Yachting Tourism

4.3.1. Policies and Regulations

When interviewees discussed policies and regulations related to yachting tourism, most lamented the lack of management rules and policy regulations, including those covering industrial planning and public marina construction, which had resulted in a mature yachting tourism system environment that had not yet fully formed. See quote, as follows:

A series of policies, including registration, cross-regional route approval, and other issues, have not been solidified at the national policy level. (Respondent 9)

Some interviewees also believed that:

The transportation department's regulations on yacht sailing, especially night sailing, are not in line with reality. (Respondent 8)

During the COVID-19 pandemic, China's tourism, maritime, and public security departments strictly controlled yachts going out to sea to contain the spread of the virus, and these inflexible policies affected the normal operation of the market. To curb COVID-19, sovereign countries have exercised stricter control on inbound tourism [54]; therefore, the development of yachting tourism in coastal areas of China should have become the "victor" of the local consumer market. However, the generic policies and regulations of the relevant government management departments have affected the local market's development opportunities. See quote, as follows:

Yacht tours are not allowed during the pandemic: Areas on the sea are often safer, but these activities are not allowed. This is a one-size-fits-all policy and is unrealistic. (Respondent 3)

Stakeholders also noted that the yacht tax is too high, and this unrealistic tax policy hinders the development of the yachting market:

The director of the tax department of the Ministry of Finance once proposed that yachts should be subject to 40% luxury tax, and then it was repeatedly reduced to 10%. At the national level, the consumption of yachts is misjudged, which makes the public believe that yachts are synonymous with luxury, status, and wealth. (Respondent 55)

The operator of the yacht club indicated that the marina has not been legalized (not included in the port law) and did not have an open port function, which has led to complicated docking procedures for foreign cross-border yachts.

Upon arrival, foreign yachts can only locate the customs for inspection and quarantine, because the marina does not have port functions. Therefore, marina legislation is a top priority. (Respondent 32)

Finally, the respondents further mentioned that the definition of a yacht is inaccurate. China's "Yacht Safety Management Regulations" state that a "yacht is a ship with a mechanical propulsion device which is only used by the yacht owner for sightseeing, leisure, and entertainment activities." The object and purpose of use are, thus, too limited, which is inconsistent with the practice of yachting and constrains the specific management of yachts.

4.3.2. Government Behaviors

The government departments involved in the supervision and service of the yacht industry include Maritime Affairs, Ocean Affairs, Border Defense, Port and Shipping, Environmental Protection, Border Inspection, and Customs, among others. In the initial stage of industrial development, the division of power between the various centralized management departments was serious, and they acted separately, which led to a lack of uniform standards for law enforcement. To a certain extent, this situation also led to the chaotic and disorderly status of China's yachting tourism industry. The respondents mentioned the relationship between several government behaviors, namely, the contradiction between the system and its implementation, the contradiction between supervision and the market, and the overlapping functions of supervisory departments:

It's not that there is no system at present, but that there is no one to implement it. When it should be implemented, government officials are talking about human relations. When it should not be implemented, it shows that there is a shirking of responsibility. (Respondent 55)

Regarding the relationship between supervision and the market, one interviewee explained:

The regulatory body should mainly focus on making rules and regulations and strictly implementing these two things. Actual operations should be handed over to the market. For example, the MSA should mainly supervise ship procedures, drivers' licenses, navigation safety, and other functions and should not be involved in the specific operation of those enterprises. (Respondent 20)

Regarding the cross-functionality of supervisory departments, the Director of the Maritime Affairs Department of Dalian MSA described a phenomenon in which the "Regulations on the Safety Management of Yachts", formulated by the Frontier Defense Department of the Public Security Bureau, conflicts with the safety law enforcement functions of the MSA, resulting in repeated law enforcement. The overlapping of the functions of the supervisory departments requires repetitive work from the operating enterprises, representing a constraint that cannot be ignored.

The researchers and tourism consumers also mentioned problems related to inadequate service and safety management, resulting from the fact that the government did not undertake the basic work of industry development in the early stage of yachting tourism. This finding coincides with previous research conclusions [1].

4.3.3. Social Development Environment

During the interviews, many interviewees discussed the environmental impact of the development of China's yachting tourism industry, made comparisons of regional development, and noted the imbalance of the development of clubs and industry associations. Therefore, the "social development environment" was listed as a separate theme. As the leaders of private enterprises, some stakeholders explained the imbalance of the regional development of different clubs:

Especially in the north of China, the development of clubs is worse than that in the south, with few member activities, even in name only. (Respondent 16)

The development of the yacht industry in China's southern coastal provinces has surpassed that in the north [54]. According to the 2019–2020 China Yacht Industry Development Report, eight of China's twelve largest yachting tourism cities are in the south, while only four are in the north. This is mainly related to the imbalance of regional economic development and the different degrees of openness in each city.

The Yacht Industry Association is an organization that connects consumers and yacht companies, and its lack of strength and development is a problem that the interviewees mentioned three times:

The linkage and communication integration among industry associations across the country is lacking. The whole Yacht Association Alliance has not come up with a specific and effective plan to make the government realize the role of the association in promoting the development of the yacht industry. (Respondent 42)

The interviewees also believed that the yacht industry has not developed into a fully comprehensive industry:

The yacht industry has a long industrial chain that involves a series of related industries such as R&D, design, manufacturing, sales, maintenance, and supporting services. Focusing only on the development of intermediate trading links impacts the integrity of the entire industry chain and reduces tourists' satisfaction with yachting tourism experiences.

4.3.4. Marketing

The development of yachting tourism ultimately depends on the recognition and consumption of the public. According to the CCYIA's 2019–2020 Yacht Industry Report, China's local yacht market comprises approximately 25,000 yachts. Compared with 2017, the market has transformed from dependence mainly on imported yachts to mainly on domestic yachts, and the sales volume of domestic yachts is now much higher than that of imported yachts. In terms of the 20 yachting tourism consumers interviewed in this study, most were male, living in coastal areas, between 35 and 44 years old, with an annual net income of less than 100,000 yuan, an education level of high school or above, and most were working in the private sector.

There remain problems in China's market for yachting consumption. The subtheme "yachts are high-end luxuries" appeared eight times in the interview data; currently, the price of yachts provided by most yacht suppliers is still high, which directly restricts the development of yachting tourism:

Although marine tourism is indeed a deep ocean, it is still in the growth stage because yachts are regarded as luxury goods and their prices are high. (Respondent 26)

Yacht chartering is an important consumption mode of yachting tourism. Due to the high cost of purchasing and maintaining yachts, the appearance of the charter consumption mode now offers tourists a variety of experiences [55]. However, chartering yachts in China is not legal. On the supply side, it is difficult for yacht enterprises to obtain approval from the relevant department to conduct yacht chartering business, and a series of problems such as collisions and crashes in the process of tourist chartering remains to be solved. See quote, as follows:

For most ordinary families, yachts are still a kind of high-end consumer good that can't be bought, but more and more consumers can afford to rent yachts. However, China's management regulations do not allow chartering, so although the charter transaction actually exists, its behavior cannot be regulated. (Respondent 3)

The product is also singular and does not fully meet the market requirements. In terms of the segmentation of the yachting tourism market, one respondent said:

Our yachting tourism market development is not sufficient to meet the needs of consumers. During [the COVID-19 pandemic], yacht safety, privacy, and other aspects are the [things people need to consider]. But the consumption of the yacht market is not clear, and product development cannot meet the diversified consumer demand, which affects the promotion of this lifestyle. (Respondent 34)

Whether the yachting tourism market can seize the opportunities resulting from the COVID-19 pandemic will depend, to a certain extent, on the development of consumer segmentation. In the absence of a value evaluation system, the public has been misled by views that yachts are luxury items that they "cannot afford" and that yacht membership and berth fees have risen uncontrollably. This has led to a narrow channel for products to be understood by the public [49].

4.3.5. Infrastructure

Eight subthemes of "infrastructure", related to public marina construction, and nine related to other infrastructure construction emerged over the course of the interviews. To counter the slow development of yachting tourism and the difficulties of yacht club operation, the question of how to build and operate public marinas is a key issue. In addition, the development of yachting tourism involves a series of operation and security activities, which rely on the continuous improvement of hardware infrastructure and supporting equipment. The lack of public marinas and supporting facilities was mentioned five times by the interviewees, for example:

The construction of public marinas and supporting facilities such as maintenance, safety, security, and monitoring [facilities] is very lacking. There is no definite conclusion and reasonable direction on who will build and how to operate public terminals in China. (Respondent 37)

At present, most cities in China have not realized that the construction of public marinas has been incorporated into the construction of urban public facilities, and the shortage of berths restricts consumers' desire to buy boats. The development level of the supporting infrastructure for yachting tourism is relatively low, as is the degree of industrial clustering. As demand-side stakeholders, the interviewed yacht consumers repeatedly mentioned that:

The development of domestic external supporting services is relatively backward and is unable to meet the needs of yacht consumers. (Respondent 30)

At the same time, a representative from a local industry association opined:

Due to the lack of overall layout planning; the lack of diving, sea fishing, and yacht bases; and the insufficient development of projects suitable for yachting tourism, the comprehensive development of the yachting tourism industry is limited. (Respondent 49)

To improve front-end safety supervision, the head of a yacht club mentioned that the government should provide financial subsidies to install AIS (Automatic Identification System) for boats, which is a measure that should be implemented in the current development stages.

4.3.6. Expertise and Manpower

Professional talents play an important role in the production, sales, operation, and maintenance of yachting tourism. The technical level and humanistic quality of yacht drivers and crew can also determine whether they can attract enough consumers to participate in yachting tourism activities.

The subtheme of "few professionals" appeared nine times in the interviews. Almost all of the supply side industry stakeholders that were interviewed stated that the lack of professional talents and the small number of graduates from relevant majors are serious current problems. Among them, the head of a yacht club mentioned that the lack of professional talents is mainly seen in a lack of management talents:

The demand for talent training is very urgent. At present, only a few colleges and universities offer professional courses related to yacht manufacturing, design, and operation, but they still cannot meet the demand. Many on-the-job personnel are sourced from other industries. (Respondent 17)

Moreover, another interviewee added:

At present, shipowners have not taken responsibility, and the overall quality of the crew is low, which leads to their weak voice in the industry. (Respondent 36)

Approaches to cultivate elite crew and train them regularly must be improved step by step. The lack of professional knowledge and talents in the tourism industry has not only been observed in the maritime tourism sector but is also often seen in many other sectors, such as medical tourism, entertainment tourism, and wine tourism [38,43,56]. Therefore,

for the vigorous development of the yachting tourism industry, the need to guide and promote talents and professional knowledge in the initial development of the industry cannot be ignored.

4.3.7. Culture

"Lack of marine culture" is a common problem in the industry and was mentioned six times by the interviewees. Behind the neglect of the marine community, on the one hand, is the deep-rooted understanding of Chinese traditional inland civilization; on the other hand, is the lack of water leisure and entertainment forms, which have not yet been popularized [57]. From a historical perspective, the control of the oceans by Western countries has affected China's rational consciousness of marine culture, which has made it difficult for the country to determine the cultural characteristics of its own ocean [58]:

We are very close to the ocean, but China's ocean awareness is very weak: The public is not interested in the ocean leisure sports culture. Most of the time, when I get to the seaside, I don't know what marine projects I can enjoy. I think yachts are playthings for rich people, and they are out of reach for ordinary people. (Respondent 20)

Therefore, the cultivation of maritime culture requires significant attention. At the same time, not only does the public lack a consciousness of maritime culture but the relevant government departments also believe that the navigation community is a minority, which directly affects the formulation of relevant policies. There is also very little publicity for the yachting industry. In China, there are 2600 yacht-related enterprises, and 114 marinas had been built by 2020. However, due to insufficient publicity, the public remain unaware of this, and do not know "how to play and where to play"; therefore, the publicity and operation of yachting tourism are very important. The lack of marine culture hinders the development of maritime tourism in China, which is consistent with the key subtheme "lack of marine culture" identified in this study.

5. Implications, Recommendations, and Conclusions

This research presents some implications for the development of yachting tourism in China and other countries. In the context of the seven major constraints on the development of yachting tourism in China identified by the study, the development suggestions discussed by the interviewees of various stakeholders are considered below, and general recommendations for countering these constraints are elaborated in detail.

5.1. Implications and Recommendations

5.1.1. Policies and Regulations

The relevant government management departments should include public yacht marinas in their national port planning and fully consider preserving the marina coastline, planning as soon as possible and constructing in stages. Yachts should be unbound from the policy level, and the registration and inspection system should be simplified. The 10% consumption tax should be gradually abolished, and an exclusive activity area should be established for yachting, allowing yachts more room to sail [43]. National unified regulations have now been issued to allow regular and qualified yachts to participate in charter activities.

The central government should issue corresponding policies specifically for yachts; clarify the definition of yachts—distinguishing them from passenger and commercial ships; and provide guidance for the rational development of yachting tourism in various locations.

5.1.2. Regulatory Authorities

All related government departments need to clarify the scope of regulatory functions, not only to avoid the pressure of the repeated supervision of yacht operation departments but also to formulate reasonable supervision and management regulations according, to the nature of the yacht market during critical periods, such as the COVID-19 pandemic. To further improve the efficiency of yachting tourism operations, we should implement a record

system and post-management. Departments should develop an effective cooperation mechanism to speed up information processing and exchange within the yacht industry.

5.1.3. Social Development Environment

Enforcing too many regulations on the specific operations of yacht clubs should be avoided, to create space for yacht club innovation and development.

The government could support the development of the yacht industry association through authorization: producing industry associations that undertake the yacht enterprise credit grade evaluation, yacht product quality certification, yacht license evaluation, industry venture capital funding, club and marina service rating, etc.; promote the survival and development of the industry associations' ability; and create a stable development environment for the industry.

Taking into account the seasonality of yachts, the seaworthiness of the northern region will be shorter, so more exhibitions and forums will be held during non-seaworthy periods to fill the gap in the development of yachting tourism in winter, which could minimize the imbalance between the development of yachting tourism in the north and south.

5.1.4. Marketing

Yachting tourism enterprises should focus on developing different entertainment options for tourists at different consumption levels and implement differentiated management following the results of in-depth market research [34]. Niche market development strategies should also be implemented according to differentiated consumer positioning. Furthermore, yacht clubs and other enterprises should consider offering personalized services.

The yachting tourism product structure must also be enriched. In the field of water tourism, yacht sightseeing, fishing, wedding, sailing, diving, water skiing, surfing, parachuting, and other yacht leisure activities can be offered. Meanwhile, in the field of shore tourism, golf, hot springs, shopping, business exhibitions, and other functions could be built or allied, and the added value of yachting tourism can be organically combined with resort hotels, yacht real estate, and other development modes. In addition, infrastructure and products for international yachting tourism should be provided in anticipation of future tourist arrivals, especially the construction of open port/wharf facilities for foreign yachts.

The yacht charter operation channel should be opened up. At the national level, the shackles of illegal charter systems have been lifted, and national unified regulations have been issued to allow regular and qualified yachts to participate in charter activities.

Finally, on the supply side, China's government management departments and yacht enterprises should focus on cultivating a popular yachting tourist market, promoting the growth of yacht demand, and developing a "two-stroke economy" (fishing and sailing) in line with current trends.

5.1.5. Infrastructure

The government management departments, together with private yacht enterprises and industry associations, should devise an overall plan for the construction of national public marinas. They should give policy support to the construction of marinas and other infrastructure and reduce the parking space and maintenance fees and other costs of completed marinas. In addition, the construction of supporting coastal service facilities should be facilitated to solve the constraints posed by the current imperfect infrastructure and lack of facilities and services. Safety and fire management, environmental protection supervision, and public health emergency response equipment should also be improved.

5.1.6. Personnel Training

To correctly understand the social needs of the yacht leisure tourism model, China's Ministry of Education has appropriately introduced courses on yacht manufacturing, sales,

Sustainability **2021**, 13, 13178 15 of 18

management, and maintenance. Outstanding foreign yacht researchers should also be encouraged, and industry elites should be trained in-depth.

The CCYIA should play its role as a bridge, collect data and information, and help colleges and universities cultivate students in all aspects related to the needs of the industry. Industry associations and yacht companies should work together to establish a yacht driver training school, determine a unified standard for yacht driving training under the supervision of the National Yacht Industry Association Alliance, and propose to the government to implement it as law.

5.1.7. Cultural Communication

Provinces and cities with more advanced yacht industries should take the lead in hosting yacht exhibitions, showing real objects and models to visitors and including VR simulations, 4D experiences, and other activities to give consumers pleasurable experiences [1]. Companies should also change their operating methods, use multimedia to promote yacht sports and sports knowledge to potential consumers, provide consumers with a variety of yacht charter projects, offer high-quality services, and strive to turn consumers into repeat customers.

5.2. Conclusions and Limitations

Yachting tourism in China is still in the preliminary stages of development. The yacht market has gradually shifted from extensive to refined and will serve as a new economic growth point in the future. However, this research concludes that the current Chinese yachting tourism market is facing a series of development constraints [22], which are threatening the sustainable development of this industry. The factors derived from this research may be used as a reference in other countries with similar development levels of yachting tourism.

This study conducted semi-structured interviews with stakeholders from public tourism management departments and private yacht companies, yachting tourism consumers, yacht industry associations of various provinces and cities, and researchers, and applied qualitative analysis techniques to confirm the nature of the development of China's yachting tourism industry. The introduction of the stakeholder perspective means that humanistic and social factors are considered in the study [31]. The development of the industry is inseparable from that of the community. An in-depth understanding of stakeholders' views on various aspects is conducive to more humanized and practical measures for the future development of the industry. This provides a theoretical reference and research ideas for further study on industry development constraints.

The results showed that there are seven major types of constraints on this development, including policy regulations, government behaviors, social development environment, marketing, infrastructure, expertise and manpower, and culture. Combining the content of the interviews held with stakeholders from five areas, it proposed several recommendations for public and private sectors, industry associations, and other departments, suggesting various long-term strategies and short-term plans for the development of yachting tourism. To truly develop China's yachting tourism industry, the following are necessary: remove the constraints of policies and regulations; establish more flexible laws and regulations that adapt to the development of the yacht market; form an effective coordination mechanism between government regulatory agencies; eliminate the imbalance between the development of yachting tourism in the north and south; implement niche market development strategies, differentiate consumer positioning; open up the yacht charter operation channel; vigorously develop the "two-stroke economy" (fishing and sailing); improve the construction of marinas and their supporting facilities; and cultivate more industry talents to provide professional and high-level yachting experience services. These suggestions also present implications for the sustainability of other tourism sectors.

This study had limitations due to technical difficulties in the arrangement of the semi-structured interviews. The interview time allocated to each stakeholder differed Sustainability **2021**, 13, 13178 16 of 18

because of their working hours, so all their views may not have been collected, which could have affected the depth of analysis. Additionally, the study aimed to determine the present constraints on China's yachting tourism; however, it did not undertake an in-depth analysis of any specific constraints. Therefore, future research should use specific research technology to deeply explore each constraint in order to propose more targeted strategies and tactics.

Author Contributions: Conceptualization, Y.Y. and R.Z.; methodology, Y.Y. and R.Z.; software, R.Z.; validation, Y.Y., R.Z. and M.P.; formal analysis, Y.Y. and R.Z.; investigation, Y.Y.; resources, Y.Y. and M.P.; writing—original draft preparation, Y.Y. and R.Z.; writing—review and editing, Y.Y., R.Z. and M.P.; supervision, Y.Y. and M.P.; funding acquisition, Y.Y. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Funding: This research was funded by The National Social Science Foundation of China, Basic Research Project in Central Universities (18CJY050/3132021295).

Informed Consent Statement: Informed consent was obtained from all subjects involved in the study.

Data Availability Statement: Not applicable.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

- Mikulić, J.; Krešić, D.; Kožić, I. Critical factors of the maritime yachting tourism experience: An impact-asymmetry analysis of principal components. J. Travel Tour. Mark. 2015, 32 (Suppl. S1), S30–S41. [CrossRef]
- 2. Diakomihalis, M.N. Chapter 13 Greek maritime tourism: Evolution, structures and prospects. *Res. Transp. Econ.* **2007**, *21*, 419–455. [CrossRef]
- Bizzarri, C.; Foresta, D.L. Yachting and pleasure crafts in relation to local development and expansion: Marina di Stabia case study. Coast. Process. 2011, 149, 53–61. [CrossRef]
- 4. Chao, C.Y. A study on the development of coastal yacht tourism in Kinmen. Actual Probl. Econ. 2012, 138, 527–539.
- 5. Sariisik, M.; Turkay, O.; Akova, O. How to manage yacht tourism in Turkey: A swot analysis and related strategies. *Procedia-Soc. Behav. Sci.* **2011**, 24, 1014–1025. [CrossRef]
- 6. Tett, P.; Valcic, B.; Potts, T.; Whyte, C.; Culhane, F.; Fernandes, T. Mussels and yachts in Loch Fyne, Scotland: A case study of the science-policy interface. *Ecol. Soc.* **2012**, *17*, 613–634. [CrossRef]
- 7. Diakomihalis, M.N.; Lagos, D.G. Estimation of the economic impacts of yachting in Greece via the tourism satellite account. *Tour. Econ.* **2008**, *14*, 871–887. [CrossRef]
- 8. Stoeckl, N.; Birtles, A.; Farr, M.; Mangott, A.; Curnock, M.; Valentine, P. Live-aboard dive boats in the great barrier reef: Regional economic impact and the relative values of their target marine species. *Tour. Econ.* **2010**, *16*, 995–1018. [CrossRef]
- 9. Łapko, A.; Strulak-Wójcikiewicz, R.; Landowski, M.; Wieczorek, R. Management of waste collection from yachts and tall ships from the perspective of sustainable water tourism. *Sustainability* **2018**, *11*, 121. [CrossRef]
- 10. Dreizis, Y.; Potashova, I.; Ilin, I.; Kalinina, O. Yachting and coastal marine transport development in black sea coast of Russia. *MATEC Web Conf.* **2018**, *170*, 05007. [CrossRef]
- 11. Cheng, J.H.; Shi, J.X.; Du, H.Y. International pleasure boat consumption pattern and Chinese pleasure boat consumer market. *J. Shanghai Marit. Univ.* **2013**, *34*, 73–76. (In Chinese)
- 12. Xiao, S.F. On the development of yacht financial business. *China Water Transp.* **2015**, *15*, 51–52. (In Chinese)
- 13. Chen, L.; Shu, B.Y. Study of the tourism market prospect of inbound yacht and its development tactics—A case study of Wuhan. *Tour. Res.* **2013**, *2*, 65–70. (In Chinese)
- 14. Xu, Z.Q.; Teng, W.Q.; Tian, Y.F. Research on the development of yacht tourism in Sanya. *China Bus. Trade* **2010**, 23, 156–157. (In Chinese)
- 15. Yao, Y.H.; Luan, W.X. Analysis on the dilemma and countermeasures of China's yachting tourism. *J. Dalian Marit. Univ. Soc. Sci. Ed.* **2017**, *16*, 12–17. (In Chinese)
- 16. Jiang, F. On the development pattern of Chinese yacht club. Urban Insight 2013, 25, 21–29. (In Chinese)
- 17. Snyder, J.; Crooks, V.A.; Turner, L.; Johnston, R. Understanding the impacts of medical tourism on health human resources in barbados: A prospective, qualitative study of stakeholder perceptions. *Int. J. Equity Health* **2013**, *12*, 2. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 18. Jamal, T.B.; Getz, D. Collaboration theory and community tourism planning. Ann. Tour. Res. 1995, 22, 186–204. [CrossRef]
- 19. Swarbrooke, J. Sustainable Tourism Management; Cabi: Wallingford, UK, 1999.
- 20. Hatipoglu, B.; Alvarez, M.D.; Ertuna, B. Barriers to stakeholder involvement in the planning of sustainable tourism: The case of the Thrace region in turkey. *J. Clean. Prod.* **2016**, *111*, 306–317. [CrossRef]
- 21. Canavan, B. Tourism stakeholder exclusion and conflict in a small island. Leisure Studies 2017, 36, 409–422. [CrossRef]

Sustainability **2021**, 13, 13178 17 of 18

22. De-Miguel-Molina, M. Visiting dark murals: An ethnographic approach to the sustainability of heritage. *Sustainability* **2020**, 12, 677. [CrossRef]

- 23. Tham, A. Sand, surgery and stakeholders: A multi-stakeholder involvement model of domestic medical tourism for Australia's Sunshine Coast. *Tour. Manag. Perspect.* **2018**, 25, 29–40. [CrossRef]
- 24. Kuang, J.X. Location analysis on the stakeholder and theirs role orientation in development of ecological tourism. *J. Cent. South Univ. For. Technol.* **2010**, *30*, 81–84. (In Chinese)
- 25. Jiang, Y.; Ritchie, B.W. Disaster collaboration in tourism: Motives, impediments and success factors. *J. Hosp. Tour. Manag.* **2017**, *31*, 70–82. [CrossRef]
- 26. Cadoret, A. Conflicts and acceptability of visitation management measures for a marine protected area: The case of porquerolles, port-cros national park. *Ocean Coast. Manag.* **2021**, 204, 105547. [CrossRef]
- 27. Park, J.D.; Yoon, Y.S.; Kim, K.H. A study on the structure of accomplishing relationship, accomplishing development and development support of marina stakeholder's cooperative relationship of marine leisure tourism. *J. Tour. Leis. Res.* **2014**, *2*, 5–24. (In Korean)
- 28. Dimitrovski, D.; Lemmetyinen, A.; Nieminen, L.; Pohjola, T. Understanding coastal and marine tourism sustainability—A multi-stakeholder analysis. *J. Destin. Mark. Manag.* **2021**, *19*, 100554. [CrossRef]
- 29. Luković, T. Nautical tourism-definition and dilemmas. *Naše More Znan. Časopis Za More I Pomor.* **2007**, *54*, 22–31.
- 30. Alcover, A.; Alemany, M.; Jacob, M.; Payeras, M.; García, A.; Martínez-Ribes, L. The economic impact of yacht charter tourism on the balearic economy. *Tour. Econ.* **2011**, *17*, 625–638. [CrossRef]
- 31. Liu, J.; Jia, N. The influence mechanism of yachting tourism behavioral intention based on an extended theory of planned behavior model. *Mar. Sci. Bull.* **2018**, *37*, 378–388. (In Chinese)
- 32. Yao, Y.H.; Liu, Y.X.; Huang, L. Motivation-based segmentation of yachting tourists in China. *Asia Pac. J. Tour. Res.* **2021**, 26, 245–261. [CrossRef]
- 33. Luo, J.M.; Chi, F.L.; Ye, B.H. Barriers for the sustainable development of entertainment tourism in Macau. *Sustainability* **2019**, 11, 2145. [CrossRef]
- 34. China Cruise and Yacht Industry Association (CCYIA). China Yacht Industry Report in 2019–2020; China Cruise & Yacht Industry Association: Beijing, China, 2020.
- 35. Paker, N.; Vural, C.A. Customer segmentation for marinas: Evaluating marinas as destinations. *Tour. Manag.* **2016**, *56*, 156–171. [CrossRef]
- 36. Chen, J.M.; Chrysanthi, B.; Nijkamp, P.; Panoraia, P.; Dimitrios, L. The sustainability of yachting tourism: A case study on Greece. *Int. J. Cult. Tour. Hosp. Res.* **2016**, *2*, 42–49. [CrossRef]
- 37. Lin, X.Y. Revised analytic introduction and constant comparative method: Approaches to qualitative research. *Peking Univ. Educ. Rev.* **2015**, *1*, 16–39. (In Chinese)
- 38. Bulatovic, I.; Iankova, K. Barriers to medical tourism development in the United Arab Emirates (UAE). *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health* **2021**, *18*, 1365. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 39. Chen, C.L.; Chang, Y.C. A transition beyond traditional fisheries: Taiwan's experience with developing fishing tourism. *Mar. Policy* **2017**, *79*, 84–91. [CrossRef]
- 40. Bilski, M. Selected human factors in marina design. Procedia Manuf. 2015, 3, 1646–1653. [CrossRef]
- 41. Sun, X.E. Grounded theory: Theory-development in in-depth interview research. *J. Xi'an Jiaotong Univ. Soc. Sci.* **2011**, *6*, 87–92. (In Chinese)
- 42. Khalil, M.; Ali, J.; Ali, I.; Rahim, K.Z. Barriers to the development of medical tourism in east Azerbaijan province, Iran: A qualitative study. *Tour. Manag.* **2018**, *69*, 307–316. [CrossRef]
- 43. Kim, H.S. A Study on the development of yacht sailing routes in relations to islands in Jeonnam Province: Focusing on the impacts of yacht sailing courses on tourist development. *J. Isl. Cult.* **2017**, *50*, 379–405. (In Korean)
- 44. Cai, L.B.; Wang, C.L. A review of overseas research on marine tourism in recent years. Tour. Forum 2018, 11, 31–42. (In Chinese)
- 45. Zhang, Y.N. Analysis about Developing Yacht Industry in Yangtze River Region and Countermeasures of Improving. Ph.D. Thesis, Shanghai Jiao Tong University, Shanghai, China, 2008. (In Chinese).
- 46. Cai, L.F.; Li, H. Opportunities and suggestions for the development of Hainan yacht port under the background of free trade port. *Reform Openning* **2018**, 17, 32–34. (In Chinese)
- 47. Heung, V.; Kucukusta, D.; Song, H. Medical tourism development in Hong Kong: An assessment of the barriers. *Tour. Manag.* **2011**, 32, 995–1005. [CrossRef]
- 48. Reid, S.; Mash, B. African primary care research: Qualitative interviewing in primary care. *Afr. J. Prim. Health Care Fam. Med.* **2014**, *6*, a632. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 49. Miao, X.L.; Xie, J. A review and reflection on the application of grounded theory: Taking studies of tourist experience as a case. *Tour. Trib.* **2021**, *4*, 122–135. (In Chinese)
- 50. Pan, J.C.; Li, H.; Wu, J. Sport Tourism Experience of "Dynamic Attachment"—Based on the in-depth Interview of 12 Sichuan-Tibetan Cycling Traversers. *J. Xi'an Phys. Educ. Univ.* **2021**, 2, 191–198. (In Chinese)
- 51. Yang, J.; Fang, H. On the influence mechanism of campus culture on employment view: Analysis of 3-stage coding based on grounded theory. *J. Innov. Entrep. Educ.* **2020**, *11*, 8–14. (In Chinese)

52. Thomas, G.; James, D. Reinventing grounded theory: Some questions about theory, ground and discovery. *Br. Educ. Res. J.* **2006**, 32, 767–795. [CrossRef]

- 53. Urquhart, C.; Lehmann, H.; Myers, M.D. Putting the 'theory' back into grounded theory: Guidelines for grounded theory studies in information systems. *Inf. Syst. J.* **2010**, *20*, 357–381. [CrossRef]
- 54. Seyfi, S.; Hall, C.M.; Shabani, B. Covid-19 and international travel restrictions: The geopolitics of health and tourism. *Tour. Geogr.* **2020**, 2. [CrossRef]
- 55. Payeras, M.; Jacob, M.; Alemany, M.; Garcia, M.A. The yachting charter tourism SWOT: A basic analysis to design marketing strategies. *Tour. Int. Multidiscip. J. Tour.* **2011**, *6*, 111–134.
- 56. Navarro, M.M.; Iglesias, M.P. Critical factors of wine tourism: Incentives and barriers from the potential tourist's perspective. *Int. J. Contemp. Hosp. Manag.* **2012**, *24*, 312–334. [CrossRef]
- 57. Yang, G.Z. The study of the maritime Silk Road and marine culture. Acad. Res. 2015, 2, 92–95. (In Chinese)
- 58. Hong, G.; Hong, X.N. The internal logic and development orientation of Chinese marine culture. *Pac. J.* **2017**, 25, 62–72. (In Chinese)